

N D. ^{1,2}*, R G___², J___H. H ³, . B___K__³, J M. G ⁴ P J. D___⁵

Colonist sources existed – Cladocera and Copepoda occurred with equal frequency in area lakes – but six separate colonizations by cladoceran species failed. We argue that local factors, metal toxicity and predation by yellow perch, have, to date, prevented cladoceran recovery. Nonetheless, the complete copepod recovery is encouraging, given the severity and duration of pre-neutralization stress.

Κ

Acid rain, colonization, Copepoda, copper, dispersal, multiple stressors, nickel, recovery, Sudbury, zooplankton.

log-transformed, species abundance matrix. Here we employ these two metrics to assess recovery in Middle Lake, constructing recovery targets from the 22 non-acidic lakes. We use the mean \pm 2 SD as our target for richness (Yan *et al.* 1996b; Kilgour *et al.* and by the early 1990s, yellow perch contributed >99% of fish caught in multiple trap net sets (J.M. Gunn, unpublished data). In summary, the physical, chemical and food web regimes of the lake have dramatically improved, in the sense that they are now more typical of non-acidified lakes. There are however two key exceptions. First, Cu and Ni levels, while greatly reduced are still elevated in comparison with remote lakes (LaZerte 1986). Secondly, most northern Ontario lakes have fish, but a community formed essentially solely of planktivorous (i.e. stunted) yellow perch is highly unusual.

In comparison with the 22 non-acidic lakes, the zooplankton community of Middle Lake has improved steadily over the last 30 years, but the entire community has not yet recovered. Ice-free season average crustacean species richness has increased from 2.6 species per standard count in 1973 to an average of six to eight species after 2000 (Fig. 2). While the pattern of improvement is clear, the target of 8–12 species per count per year (Yan *et al.*

	Cladocera†							Copepoda‡								
	S. sp	C. s.	B. l.	D. b.	D. m.	H. g.	A. v.	O. m.	Су. с.	Ca. c.	L. m.	C.b.t.	S. o.	Т. е.	М. е.	
CA1	2.32	1.13	0.58	0.25	0.08	-0.72	2.32	1.75	0.25	0.07	0.01	-0.29	-0.38	-0.38	-0.39	
CA2	3.63	0.54	-0.15	-0.64	-0.46	0.18	1.39	-0.89	0.06	-0.34	-0.4	0.02	0.22	0.29	0.46	
1973		329	48647				17		112							
1974		37	1071				157		48	248		0.7				
1975	0.2	394	122				10		47	1	0.1	0.1		0.2		
1976		17192	113				26		86	8						
1977	19.9	3707	18				118		4574	4	5.3		0.7			
1978	8.9	1265	5				64	51	7767							
1979§	7.8	555	1066				75	293	1242	40	6.7					
1981		26	6994				3		98	18883	2843					
1982	5.1	194	219						18	85137	4249					
1983		174	6412					45	108	110614	4124					
1984		164	9517					3.8	75	25898	1513					
1985	0.5	21	176					1.1	23	14826	1992					
1986		27	257	9	10		2		188	11216	1393					
1987		379	12668		18		0.5	110	430	16674	1131					
1988		406	25936	23	77			19	129	24798	2171					
1989	0.7	39	62892	105	25	1		11	265	39223	4415	28				
1990		22	33678	70	521				11881	32066	1504	1469				
1991		65	67997	3352	272				12914	13776	3018	1248				
1992		18	32094	646	3822				2701	24605	2025	1227				
1993		22	17859	366	1699				6273	22391	1971	895	6			
1994		93	45584	5565	1920				14077	12716	1078	2460	32			
1995		21	68681	4247	499				6340	6615	410	745	9	93		
1996		41	106931	6233	2071				14678	20442	959	924	1094	442		
1997			31551	12730	2817				4988	27941	1082	941	1025	109		
1998		15	47695	10770	2721				12827	31363	1018	593	832	838		
1999		83	25764	7033	1573				7686	22427	1150	1001	903	946		
2000		155	49714	3155	3255				8748	18868	311	1513	785	737		
2001		44	4256	933	1196	12			6234	6199	644	486	770	150	13	
2002		8	4684	829	3343				6231	8396	570	332	598	328	216	

- 1 Ice-free season average abundances (animals per m³) of all zooplankton taxa recorded in two or more years in Middle Lake*

Cladoceran and copepod species are separately sorted based on the ranks of taxa scores on the first CA axis of their respective ordinations (see Figs 3 and 4). CA axis I and II scores of the taxa are provided.

*Additional species recorded in just a single year in Middle Lake were Daphnia dubia in 1985, Eubosmina tubicen in 1986, Daphnia longiremus, Daphnia pulex and Daphnia retrocurva in 1990, Epischura lacustris in 1992, and Cyclops scutifer in 1996. Additional species found only in the reference lakes that were included in the analyses were the Cladocera: Daphnia ambigua, Polyphemus pediculus and Eubosmina longispina.

[†]These Cladocera are Simocephalus sp. (S. sp), Chydorus sphaericus (C.s.), Bosmina longirostris (B.l.), Diaphanosoma birgei (D.b.), Daphnia mendotae (D.m.) and Holopedium gibberum (H.g.).

[‡]These Copepoda are Acanthocylops vernalis (A.v.), Orthocyclops modestus (O.m.), cyclopoid copepodid (cy.c.), calanoid copepodid (ca.c.), Leptodiaptomus minutus (L.m.), Cyclops bicuspidatus thomasi (C.b.t.), Skistodiaptomus oregonensis (S.o.), Tropocyclops extensus (T.e.), and Mesocyclops edax (M.e.)

§The lake was not sampled in 1980.

O. modestus, the appearance of L. minutus and S. oregonensis, the two most common calanoid copepods in Ontario (Rigler & Langford 1967), and the appearance of stable populations of three other common cyclopoid copepods, C. bicuspidatus thomasi, T. extensus and M. edax (Table 1). On average the number of copepod species in the Middle Lake assemblage increased from one in 1973 to five in 2002, accounting for the majority of the increase in zooplankton species richness (Fig. 2).

In contrast to the copepods, the cladoceran trajectory was promising, but recovery has stalled (Fig. 4a). The acid- and metal-tolerant *Bosmina longirostris* and *Chydorus sphaericus* remain dominant members of the assemblage (Table 1). The 1986 appearances of *Diaphanosoma birgei* and *Daphnia* mendotae

REFERENCE

- Allen, G., Yan, N.D. & Geiling, W.T. (1994). ZEBRA2 Zooplankton enumeration and biomass routines for APIOS: a semiautomated sample processing system for zooplankton ecologists. Ontario Ministry of the Environment Report, Dorset, Ontario.
- Beamish, R.J. & Harvey, H.H. (1972). Acidification of the La Cloche Mountain Lakes, Ontario, and resulting fish mortalities. *J. Fish. Res. Board Can.*, 29, 1131–1143.
- Biesinger, K.E. & Christensen, G.M. (1972). Effects of various metals on survival, growth, reproduction, and metabolism of Daphnia magna. J. Fish. Res. Board Can., 29, 1691–1700.
- Boudreau, S.A. & Yan, N.D. (2003). The differing crustacean zooplankton communities of Canadian Shield lakes with and without the non-indigenous zooplanktivore, Bythotrephes. *Can. J. Fisb. Aquat. Sci.*, 60, 1307–1313.
- Cáceres, C.E. & Soluk, D.A. (2002). Blowing in the wind: a field test of overland dispersal and colonization by aquatic invertebrates. *Oecologia*, 131, 402–408.
- Conroy, N., Hawley, K., Keller, W. & Lafrance, C. (1976). Influences of the atmosphere on lakes in the Sudbury area. J. Great Lakes Res., 2(Suppl. 1), 146–165.
- Dillon, P.J. & Smith, P.J. (1984). Trace metal and nutrient accumulation in the sediments of lakes near Sudbury, Ontario. In: *Environmental Impacts Smelters* (ed. Nriagu, J.). J. Wiley & Sons, NY, pp. 375–416.
- Dillon, P.J., Yan, N.D., Scheider, W.A. & Conroy, N. (1979). Acidic lakes in Ontario, Canada: characterization, extent and responses to base and nutrient additions. *Arch. Hydrobiol. Beib.*, 13, 317–336.
- Dixit, A.S., Dixit, S.S. & Smol, J.P. (1992). Long-term trends in lakewater pH and metal concentrations inferred from diatoms and chrysophytes in three lakes, near Sudbury, Ontario. *Can. J. Fisb. Aquat. Sci.*, 49 (Suppl. 1), 17–24.
- Doka, S.E., McNicol, D.K. Mallory, M.L., Wong, I., Minns, C.K. & Yan, N.D. (2003). Assessing potential for recovery of biotic richness and indicator species due to changes in acidic deposition and lake pH in five areas of southeastern Canada. *Environ. Monitor. Assess.*, 88, 55–101.
- Girard, R., Yan, N.D., Heneberry, J. & Keller, W.B. (2004). Physical and Chemical Data Series from Clearwater, Lohi, Middle and Hannah Lakes Near Sudbury, Ontario: Long-Term Responses to Liming, and Natural Recovery from Historical Acidification and Metal Contamination. Ontario Ministry of the Environment, Dorset Environment Science Centre Report, Dorset, Ontario, 160 pp.
- Gorham, E. & Gordon, A.G. (1960). The influence of smelter fumes upon the chemical composition of lake waters near Sudbury, Ontario, and upon-surrounding vegetation. *Can. J. Botany*, 38, 477–487.
- Gunn, J.M., MacKay, L.E., Deacon, L.I., Stewart, T.J., Hicks, F.J., Munroe, B.P. et al. (1988). Long-term monitoring of fish communities in acid sensitive lakes in Ontario. Lake Reservoir Manage., 4, 123–134.
- Gunn, J.M., Snucins, E., Yan, N.D. & Arts, M.T. (2001). Use of water clarity to monitor the effects of climate change and others stressors on oligotrophic lakes. *Env. Monitor. Assess.*, 67, 69–88.
- Hairston, N.G., Jr., Dillon, T.A. & DeStasio, B.T., Jr. (1990). A field test for the cues of diapause in a freshwater copepod. *Ecology*, 71, 2218–2223.

- Holt, C.A., Yan, N.D. & Somers, K. (2003). pH 6 as the threshold to use in critical load modelling for zooplankton community change with acidification in lakes of south-central Ontario: accounting for morphometry and geography. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.*, 60, 151–158.
- Hughes, T.P. & Connell, J.H. (1999). Multiple stressors on coral reefs: a long-term perspective. *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 44, 932–940.
- Keller, W. & Pitblado, J.R. (1986). Water quality changes in

- Scheider, W. & Dillon, P.J. (1976). Neutralization and fertilization of acidified lakes near Sudbury, Ontario. Wat. Pollut. Res. Can., 11, 93–100.
- Scheider, W.A., Adamski, J. & Paylor, M. (1975). Reclamation of Acidified Lakes Near Sudbury, Ontario. Ontario Ministry of the Environment Report, Toronto, 129 pp.